

Perit Daniel Cordina

B.E. & A. (Hons.), M.Sc (Road Engineering), A.& C.E.

"Aurora"

Mdina Road

Attard

Mob. 9945-4496

20TH APRIL 2015

Rabat Local Council

8, Triq l-Isptar,

Rabat

RBT 1043

Adjudication Report for Collection of mixed Household Waste in an Environmentally Friendly Manner.

3 submissions were received for the call of tenders in caption issued by the Rabat Local Council as follows:

	Tenderer 1	Tenderer 2	Tenderer 3
Name	Saviour Mifsud	WM Environmental Ltd	Waste Collection Ltd
Address	Rainbow Court, Flat 11, Triq l- Eroj, Zebbug	13, Triq l- Ghasir, Zebbug	131, Mdina Road, Zebbug
Contact Person	Saviour Mifsud	Wilson Mifsud	Mario Muscat

DANIEL CORDINA
B.E.&A.(Hons) M.Sc.(Road Eng) A.&C.E.
ARCHITECT AND CIVIL ENGINEER
"Aurora", Mdina Road
Attard BZN 05 Malta



Administrative Assessment and Compliance.

The submissions were analyzed and all the required documentation as requested in the tender dossier were found namely:

- The Form of Tender;
- The Non-Collusive Tendering Certificate;
- The priced Bills of Quantities;
- Declaration of Understanding;
- Statement on Conditions of Employment;
- Waste Carriers full technical Specifications, compliance certificates and information.

All the documents listed above were completed adequately and could be considered further.

It was noted that Tenderers 1 and 2 submitted bid bonds of €6000 - G82TFC39238 BOV and G82TFC39338 BOV respectively whilst Tenderer 3 submitted a Tender Guarantee (Bid Bond) of €4660 - BNF40904990041 Banif Bank. Due to the fact that the tender dossier clearly stated that the value of the contract exceeds €500,000 and also due to the fact that all the 3 offers submitted exceed the €116,471; the value of the bid bond as stipulated in table in page 6 clause 8 of the tender dossier had to be €5,823.43. Due to this fact Tenderer 3 could not be considered for award. These findings may be found in Table 1 in Annex A.

Technical Assessment and Compliance.

The submissions were then assessed for the Necessary capacity and experience to the required services, References of successfully completed contracts of similar nature and execution, the Number of Default Notices issued to the bidder on the past contracts – (the past 36 months only) and the Quality of service proposed – findings may be found in Table 2 in Annex B.

DANIEL CORDINA
B.E.&A.(Hons) M.Sc.(Road Eng) A.&C.E.
ARCHITECT AND CIVIL ENGINEER
"Aurora", Mdina Road
Attard BZN 65 Malta

Tenderer 1 and 2 obtained the maximum points for the submissions, a total of 80 points whilst Tenderer 3 obtained a total of 77 points.

Financial Assessment.

The financial submissions were assessed as per Table 3 in Annex C. Tenderer 2 submitted the lowest financial proposal which is approximately 1.2% lower than the offer submitted by Tenderer 1 and 22.5% lower than the offer submitted by Tenderer 3.

Recommendation.

Tenderers 1 and 2 obtained the same marks in the technical capacity analysis and therefore the award criterion was the financial offer. Tenderer 2, namely WM Environmental Ltd has the lowest and technically compliant offer. It is being recommended that the contract is awarded to **WM Environmental Ltd.**

DANIEL CORDINA
B.E.&A.(Hons) M.Sc.(Road Eng) A.&C.E.
ARCHITECT AND CIVIL ENGINEER
"Aurora", Mdina Road
Attard BZN 05 Malta



Perit Daniel Cordina

Warrant Number: 465

ANNEX A


DANIEL CORDINA
B.E.&A.(Hons) M.Sc.(Road Eng) A.&C.E.
ARCHITECT AND CIVIL ENGINEER
"Aurora", Mdina Road
Attard BZN 05 Malta



Table 1

	1	2	3
The Form of Tender	Savour Milaud Filed in and submitted	WM Environmental Ltd Filed in and submitted	Waste Collection Limited Filed in and submitted
The Non-Collusive Tendering Certificate	Filed in and submitted	Filed in and submitted	Filed in and submitted
The Tender Guarantee (BIZ Bonus)	GRZTC39238 BOV - 56000 submitted	GRZTC39338 BOV - 60000 submitted	88F4090499004 BOV - 61800 submitted
The priced Bill of Quantities	Filed in and submitted	Filed in and submitted	Filed in and submitted
Declaration of Understanding	Filed in and submitted	Filed in and submitted	Filed in and submitted
Statement on Conditions of Employment	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted
Waste Carriers full technical specification, compliance certifications and information	Submitted	Tenderer provided option which includes Disposal Fee, €733 daily for Ghallis Landfill Disposal for all the 4 years and €740 daily for Sant Antolin Waste Treatment Plant disposal for all the 4 years.	Submitted
Any other document specifically required by the Local Council	Nil		Nil

DANIEL CORDINA
 I.E & A. (Hons) M.Sc. (Road Eng) A.&C.E.
 ARCHITECT AND CIVIL ENGINEER
 "Aurora", Mdina Road
 Attard BZN 05 Malta



ANNEX B

DANIEL CORDINA
B.E. & A (Hons) M.Sc.(Road Eng) A.&C.E.
ARCHITECT AND CIVIL ENGINEER
"Aurora", Mdina Road
Attard BZN 05 Malta



Table 2

	3 Saviour Misud	2 W4 Environmental Ltd	3 Waste Collection Limited
Criteria			
1. Necessary capacity and experience to conduct the required services.			
1.1 Human resources to be dedicated to the contract.	6 employees to be utilized as per submission PR 99	Tenderer submitted a quality assurance report of the operations in line with the tender requirements.	5,25 employees to be utilized
1.2 Ownership of waste collection vehicles to be dedicated to the contract.	LC5747; ACB702; DBU937 - Certificates attached PR 111-113	FCF558; KRS014; KBR978; JBR473; KRP685 - All owned by Tenderer as per logbook submissions	LCR702; LCV997; BCE432; LGS738; TOP001; JBR175; JBR119; ABT713; ABX448; LCR948; EEF788; KRC697; KRC606; KRP666 - All owned by Tenderer as per logbook submissions
1.3 Exhaust, gas and noise emissions.	LC5747; ACB702; DBU937 - Certificates attached PR 111-113	FCF558; KRS014; KBR978; JBR473; KRP685 - Submitted in A45 report.	LCR702 - only certificates submitted
2. Date of Manufacture of collection vehicle/s	LC5747 - 2012; ACB702 - 2010; DBU937 - 2007 - as per sub PR 111-113	FCF558-2009; KRS014-2009; KBR978 -2009; JBR473 -2006; KRP685 -2006 - All as per logbook submissions	LCR702-2009; LCV997-2006; BCE432-2008; LGS738-2007; TOP001-2007; JBR175-2007; JBR119-2004; ABT713-2004; ABX448-2004; LCR948-1997; EEF788-1997; KRC697-2005; KRC606-2005; KRP666 -2005.
3. Reference(s) of successfully completed contracts of similar nature and execution	LC5747 - Euro 5; ACB702 - Euro 4 - as per sub PR 111-113	FCF558 - Euro 5; KRS014 - Euro 5; KBR978 - Euro 5; JBR473 - Euro 5; KRP685 - Euro 5	LCR702-Euro 5; LCV997-Euro 5; BCE432-Euro 5; LGS738-Euro 4; TOP001-Euro 4; JBR175-Euro 4; JBR119-Euro 3; ABT713-Euro 3; ABX448-Euro 3.
3. Number of defect notices issued to the bidder on part contract - the past 16 months only.	Nil	Nil	Nil
4. Quality of service proposed: The Council will allocate these points based on the overall quality of the service to be provided.	The tenderer is proposing that 6 employees and 3 vehicles are to be assigned. Collection time is 4 hours. Bins emptied daily and all employees to be given safety equipment.	Referrals from Rabat LC, Ghaxaq LC, Fgura LC, Qormi LC, Mosta LC, Zebbug LC, Zgħajn LC, Lija LC, San Pawl Il-Bahar LC and Mdina LC attached.	Referrals from Vallerija LC, Siggiewi LC, Lija LC, San Gillan LC & Mtarfa LC
	5	5	5
	80	80	77

DANIEL CORDINA
 B.Eng (Hons) M.Sc. (Road Eng) A.&CE
 ARCHITECT AND CIVIL ENGINEER
 "AURORA", Mdina Road
 Att: 08 BZN 05 Malta



ANNEX C


DANIEL CORDINA
B.E. & A. (Hons) M.Sc. (Road Eng) A.&C.E.
ARCHITECT AND CIVIL ENGINEER
'Aurora', Mdina Road
Attard BZN 05 Malta 

Table 3

Description - Table A	Year 1			Year 2			Year 3			Year 4		
	1	2	3	1	2	3	1	2	3	1	2	3
Collection of mixed household waste from all premises and/or bins on wheels in the area indicated in Annex 4 including all roadside litter bins five (5) days a week.												
1.1 Rate for kerbside collection(s) per day with waste delivered to Ghallis non-hazardous waste landfill	€ 329.00	€ 383.00	€ 417.00	€ 329.00	€ 383.00	€ 417.00	€ 332.00	€ 383.00	€ 417.00	€ 332.00	€ 383.00	€ 417.00
1.2 Rate for kerbside collection(s) per day with waste delivered to Sant'Antnin Waste Treatment Plant, M'Scala	€ 329.00	€ 370.00	€ 417.00	€ 329.00	€ 370.00	€ 417.00	€ 332.00	€ 370.00	€ 417.00	€ 332.00	€ 370.00	€ 417.00
1.3 Rate for emptying of bins on wheels per day (including provision of bins on wheels) with waste delivered to Ghallis non-hazardous waste landfill	€ 82.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00	€ 82.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00	€ 82.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00	€ 82.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00
1.4 Rate for emptying of bins on wheels per day (including provision of bins on wheels) with waste delivered to Sant'Antnin Waste Treatment Plant, M'Scala	€ 82.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00	€ 82.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00	€ 82.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00	€ 82.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00
	€ 658.00	€ 753.00	€ 834.00	€ 658.00	€ 753.00	€ 834.00	€ 664.00	€ 753.00	€ 834.00	€ 664.00	€ 753.00	€ 834.00
	€ 164.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00	€ 164.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00	€ 164.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00	€ 164.00	€ 0.00	€ 0.00
	€ 822.00	€ 753.00	€ 834.00	€ 822.00	€ 753.00	€ 834.00	€ 828.00	€ 753.00	€ 834.00	€ 828.00	€ 753.00	€ 834.00
Allowable Variable Costs - Table B												
Cost of fuel of the total amount quoted in:												
Item 1.1	€ 60.00	€ 120.00	€ 105.00	€ 60.00	€ 120.00	€ 108.00	€ 60.00	€ 120.00	€ 111.00	€ 60.00	€ 120.00	€ 114.00
Item 1.2	€ 65.00	€ 105.00	€ 110.00	€ 65.00	€ 105.00	€ 113.00	€ 65.00	€ 105.00	€ 116.00	€ 65.00	€ 105.00	€ 119.00
Item 1.3	€ 20.00	€ 0.00	€ 95.00	€ 20.00	€ 0.00	€ 98.00	€ 20.00	€ 0.00	€ 101.00	€ 20.00	€ 0.00	€ 104.00
Item 1.4	€ 20.00	€ 0.00	€ 100.00	€ 20.00	€ 0.00	€ 103.00	€ 20.00	€ 0.00	€ 106.00	€ 20.00	€ 0.00	€ 109.00
Disposal fee per tonne at authorized facilities	€ 23.00			€ 23.00			€ 23.00			€ 23.00		

DANIEL CORDINA
 B.Eng. (Hons) M.Sc. (Road Eng) A.C.E.
 ARCHITECT AND CIVIL ENGINEER
 "Aurora", Mdina Road
 St. Paul's Bay BZN 05 Malta